

**Headwaters Forest Reserve  
Proposed Resource Management Plan  
and Final EIS/EIR**

**Volume I**

*Prepared for:*

USDI Bureau of Land Management and  
California Department of Fish and Game  
1695 Heindon Road  
Arcata, CA 95521-4573  
Contact: Lynda Roush  
707/825-2300

*Prepared by:*

Jones & Stokes  
2600 V Street  
Sacramento, CA 95818-1914  
916/737-3000

September 2003

Jones & Stokes. 2003. Headwaters Forest Reserve proposed resource management plan and final EIS/EIR. Volume I. September. (J&S 00090.) Sacramento, CA. Prepared for USDI Bureau of Land Management and California Department of Fish and Game, Arcata, CA.

# Contents

	Page
<b>VOLUME I</b>	
Tables.....	vi
Figures .....	viii
Acronyms and Abbreviations .....	x
<b>Chapter 1 . Introduction .....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
Background .....	1-1
Purpose of and Need for Management Plan (Project Objective).....	1-2
Planning Period and Plan Revision .....	1-2
NEPA/CEQA Provisions .....	1-3
General.....	1-3
Programmatic Aspects.....	1-4
Impact Baseline and No-Action Alternative: Interim Management .....	1-4
Process and Required Approvals to Achieve Final Plan and Final EIS/EIR.....	1-4
Organization of This Document.....	1-4
<b>Chapter 2 . Planning Framework.....</b>	<b>2-1</b>
Existing Direction for Land-Use Planning and Management .....	2-1
Legal Requirements .....	2-1
Management Guidelines .....	2-5
Planning Issues.....	2-7
Issues to Be Addressed.....	2-7
Issues Dismissed.....	2-8
Planning Criteria.....	2-8
Extent of Analysis .....	2-8
Range of Alternatives.....	2-11
Planning Assumptions .....	2-11

<b>Chapter 3 . Affected Environment (Environmental Setting) and Interim Management of the Reserve.....</b>	3-1
Physical Environment .....	3-1
Location.....	3-1
Climate .....	3-1
Geology and Soils .....	3-2
Minerals .....	3-3
Social Environment .....	3-3
Adjacent Land Use.....	3-3
Timber Management History .....	3-3
Biological Resources .....	3-4
Watershed and Aquatic Habitat Conditions .....	3-4
Forest Vegetation.....	3-7
Aquatic Species and Habitat Needs .....	3-13
Wildlife Species and Habitat Needs .....	3-16
Interim Management of Biological Resources.....	3-22
Fire Regime and Hazard.....	3-24
Natural Fire Regime.....	3-24
Fire Risk.....	3-24
Visual Resources .....	3-28
Cultural Resources .....	3-28
Known Resources .....	3-28
Resource Condition .....	3-29
Interim Management .....	3-29
Recreation Activities .....	3-29
Access to the Reserve .....	3-29
Existing Trail Network .....	3-30
Interim Access and Use Limitations within the Reserve .....	3-30
Visitation and Visitor Preferences.....	3-30
Suitability for Special-Area Designations .....	3-31
Socioeconomic Environment.....	3-32
Locally Affected Communities .....	3-32
Regional Recreation Opportunities.....	3-32
Management Revenues .....	3-34
Existing Funding for Reserve Management.....	3-34
Federal/State Experiences with Recreation User Fees .....	3-34
<b>Chapter 4 . Management Goals and Direction.....</b>	4-1
Introduction .....	4-1
Primary Focus of Reserve Management.....	4-2
Species Management .....	4-3
Management Goals .....	4-3
Species-Specific Goals, Management Direction, and Implementation Guidelines .....	4-4
Restoration of Old-Growth and Aquatic Ecosystems.....	4-13
Watershed Restoration .....	4-14
Forest Restoration .....	4-18
Research Management .....	4-23
Management Goals .....	4-23
Management Direction.....	4-23
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-25
Fire Management .....	4-28

Management Goals .....	4-28
Management Direction .....	4-29
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-30
Visual Resource Management .....	4-31
Recreation Access Management .....	4-31
Management Goals .....	4-31
Management Direction .....	4-32
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-34
Cultural Resource Management .....	4-37
Management Goals .....	4-37
Management Direction .....	4-38
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-39
Management of Areas Having Wilderness Characteristics .....	4-39
Management Goals .....	4-39
Management Direction .....	4-40
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-41
Special Areas Designation and Management .....	4-43
Area of Critical Environmental Concern/Research .....	
Natural Area .....	4-43
Special Recreation Management Area .....	4-44
National Register of Historic Places .....	4-44
National Wild and Scenic River System .....	4-45
State of California Ecological Reserve .....	4-46
Off-Highway Vehicle Designations .....	4-46
Resource Monitoring and Evaluation .....	4-47
Management Goals .....	4-47
Management Direction .....	4-47
Implementation Guidelines .....	4-48
Management Revenue and Expenditures .....	4-49
Management Goals .....	4-49
Management Direction .....	4-49
<b>Chapter 5 . Management Alternatives .....</b>	<b>5-1</b>
Introduction .....	5-1
Alternatives for Restoration of Old-Growth and Aquatic Ecosystems .....	5-2
Alternatives for Recreation Management .....	5-3
Alternatives for Lands Having Wilderness Characteristics .....	5-7
Alternatives for Special-Area Designations .....	5-7
Alternatives for Management Revenue .....	5-9

## **VOLUME II**

<b>Chapter 6 . Environmental Consequences (Environmental Effects and Alternative Comparisons) .....</b>	<b>6-1</b>
Introduction .....	6-1
Effects Summary.....	6-2
Summary Effects of No Action.....	6-2
Summary Effects of Proposed Action.....	6-2
Species Management .....	6-3
Effects of Species Management on Special-Status Species.....	6-4
Effects of Species Management on Common Species .....	6-4
Effects of Species Management on Recreation .....	6-4
Watershed Restoration .....	6-4
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Water Quality and Aquatic Species .....	6-4
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Forest Structure and Old-Growth Characteristics .....	6-7
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Special-Status Plants .....	6-8
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Invasive Nonnative Plants .....	6-8
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Wildlife .....	6-9
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Fire Suppression .....	6-12
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Recreation Activities .....	6-12
Effects of Watershed Restoration on Cultural Resources .....	6-12
Forest Restoration .....	6-12
Effects of Forest Restoration on Forest Structure and Old-Growth Characteristics.....	6-12
Effects of Forest Restoration on Special-Status Plants .....	6-16
Effects of Forest Restoration on Invasive Nonnative Plants .....	6-17
Effects of Forest Restoration on Water Quality and Aquatic Species .....	6-18
Effects of Forest Restoration on Wildlife .....	6-19
Effects of Forest Restoration on Fire Behavior and Fire Management .....	6-22
Effects of Forest Restoration on Recreation Activities .....	6-24
Effects of Forest Restoration on Cultural Resources.....	6-24
Research Management .....	6-25
Effects of Research Management on Research Activities .....	6-25
Effects of Research Management on Biological Resources .....	6-25
Effects of Research Management on Resource Monitoring .....	6-25
Fire Management .....	6-26
Effects of Fire Suppression on Fire Frequency and Behavior .....	6-26
Effects of Fire Suppression on Biological Resources .....	6-26

Effects of Fire Suppression on Research.....	6-27
Effects of Fire Suppression on Recreation.....	6-27
Visual Resource Management .....	6-27
Recreation Management .....	6-28
Effects of Recreation Management on Visitor Experiences .....	6-28
Effects of Recreation on Special-Status Plants.....	6-32
Effects of Recreation on Invasive Nonnative Species .....	6-33
Effects of Recreation Management on Aquatic Ecosystems.....	6-33
Effects of Recreation on Wildlife .....	6-36
Effects of Recreation Management on Cultural Resources .....	6-42
Socioeconomic Effects of Recreation Management .....	6-43
Effects of Recreation on Fire Behavior and Management .....	6-44
Effects of Recreation on Resource Monitoring.....	6-44
Management of Areas Having Wilderness Characteristics.....	6-45
Management of Designated Special Areas .....	6-45
Wild and Scenic River.....	6-45
State of California Ecological Reserve .....	6-46
Resource Monitoring and Evaluation .....	6-46
Effects of Resource Monitoring on Ecological Resources .....	6-46
Effects of Monitoring on Visitation .....	6-47
Management Revenue.....	6-47
Effects Common to All Management Revenue Alternatives .....	6-47
Relative Effects of the Management Revenue Alternatives .....	6-47

## **Chapter 7 . Comments and Responses to Comments on the Draft**

Plan/EIS/EIR.....	7-1
Summary.....	7-1
Summary of Comments Received on the Draft Document.....	7-1
Summary of BLM/DFG Responses .....	7-2
Section I. Public Comment Process .....	7-4
Section II. Commenting Public Agencies (3).....	7-5
1. California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CDFFP) .....	7-5
2. California Regional Water Quality Control Board, North Coast Region .....	7-6
3. United States Environmental Protection Agency .....	7-7
Section III. Commenting Organizations (15) .....	7-8
4. The League of Women Voters of Humboldt County .....	7-9
5. Pacific Lumber Company (PALCO).....	7-10
6. Bay Area Coalition for Headwaters & the Environmental Protection Information Center .....	7-11
7. Friends of the River.....	7-15
8. Sierra Club, North Group, Redwood Chapter .....	7-16
9. Wildlife Management Institute .....	7-16

10. Forests Forever.....	7-17
11. Forests Unlimited .....	7-17
12. Friends of Yosemite Valley for Future Generations .....	7-18
13. The North Coast Environmental Council.....	7-18
14. Blueribbon Coalition.....	7-18
15. Antelope Valley Trails, Recreation & Environmental Council .....	7-19
16. California Equestrian Trails & Lands Coalition.....	7-19
17. Back Country Horsemen of California .....	7-20
18. International Mountain Bicycling Association (IMBA) .....	7-20
Section IV. Persons Commenting at Public Meetings (27) .....	7-24
Summary of Comments and Responses.....	7-25
Section V. Individuals Commenting Via Mail (6,372) .....	7-35
Form Message 1 .....	7-37
Form Message 2 .....	7-38
Form Message 3 .....	7-38
Form Message 4 .....	7-39
Individualized Messages.....	7-40
<b>Chapter 8. References Cited.....</b>	<b>8-1</b>
Printed References .....	8-1
Personal Communications.....	8-8

**Appendix A. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Species List**

**Appendix B. Applicable Management Guidelines from the Northwest Forest Plan**

**Appendix C. Reserve Legislation**

**Appendix D. Federal Recreational Fee Demonstration Program**

**Appendix E. Visual Resource Management Classes**

**Appendix F. Visitor Management Zones**

**Appendix G. Headwaters Wilderness Inventory and Study**

**Appendix H. Wild and Scenic River Eligibility and Suitability Study**

**Appendix I. State of California Ecological Reserve Regulations**

**Appendix J. Alternatives Considered But Eliminated**

**Appendix K. List of Preparers**

**Appendix L. Individuals and Organizations Receiving Notice of This Document**

**Appendix M. Index**

**Appendix N. Supplemental Rules**

# Tables

**Follows Page**

## **VOLUME I**

3-1	Extent of Potential Natural Vegetation Types in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	On 3-8
3-2	Environmental Characteristics of Vegetation Types in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	On 3-8
3-3	Seral Stages of the Headwaters Forest.....	On 3-9
3-4	Special-Status Vascular Plants with Potential to Occur in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-12
3-5	Fungi and Lichen Survey-and-Manage Species Identified in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-12
3-6	Special-Status Fish and Wildlife Species of the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-14
3-7	Existing Suitable Nesting Habitat for Northern Spotted Owl and Marbled Murrelet in the Headwaters Forest Reserve .....	On 3-20
3-8	Topographic Position of Existing Trails .....	On 3-26
3-9	Risk of Stand-Replacing Fire of Various Seral Stages and Topographic Positions .....	On 3-27
3-10	Summary of Existing RSRF at the Reserve .....	On 3-27
3-11	Status of Regional Recreation Opportunities .....	3-34
4-1	Approximate Extent of Road Decommissioning Needed in the Reserve.....	On 4-15
4-2	Factors Determining Priority of Watersheds for Watershed Restoration.....	On 4-17
4-3	Forest Restoration Objectives by Seral Stage .....	4-20

4-4	Extent and Factors Determining Priority of Areas for Forest Restoration.....	4-20
4-5	Estimated Prescription Data for Alternative 2A: Medium Intensity Forest Restoration .....	4-22
4-6	Estimated Prescription Data for Alternative 2B: Low Intensity Forest Restoration .....	4-22
4-7	Monitoring Needs for Plan Implementation .....	4-22
4-8	Costs of Reserve Management .....	4-48
5-1	Summary of Management Alternatives .....	5-2
5-2	Existing and Potential Components of a Recreation Trail System for the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	5-4
5-3	Trail Routes of the Recreation Access Alternatives .....	5-4

## **VOLUME II**

6-1	Summary of Environmental Consequences .....	6-2
6-2	Extent of Watershed Restoration.....	On 6-7
6-3	Extent of Forest Restoration Candidate Areas.....	On 6-15
6-4	Risk of Stand-Replacing Fire (RSRF) of Stands to Be Treated under the Forest Restoration Alternatives .....	On 6-23
6-5	Fire Ignition Hazard of the Forest Restoration and Trail Alternatives .....	6-24
6-6	Area of Wildlife Habitat Disturbance for the Recreation Alternatives .....	On 6-38
6-7	Marbled Murrelet Habitat within ¼ -Mile of Proposed Trails .....	6-38
6-8	Constraints Imposed by Special-Area Designations and Their Implications .....	6-46

# Figures

**Follows Page**

## **VOLUME I**

1-1	Location of the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	1-2
3-1	General Characteristics of the Headwaters Forest Reserve .....	3-2
3-2	Geology and Watersheds of the Headwaters Forest Reserve .....	3-2
3-3	Timber Harvest History of the Headwaters Forest Reserve .....	3-4
3-4a	Generalized Seral Stages of Vegetation in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-10
3-4b	Detailed Seral Stages of Vegetation in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-10
3-5	Range of Anadromy in the Headwaters Forest Reserve .....	3-10
3-6	Marbled Murrelet Nesting Survey Results in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-20
3-7	Northern Spotted Owl Nesting Behavior Sightings in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	3-20
3-8	Regional Recreation Opportunities.....	3-32
4-1	Proposed Watershed Restoration in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	4-14
4-2	Interpretive Facilities Proposed for the Elk River Corridor .....	4-32
5-1	Visitor Management Zones and Potential Trail System in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	5-4
5-2	Visitor Management Zones and Proposed Trail System in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	5-6
5-3	Alternatives for Lands Having Wilderness Characteristics in the Headwaters Forest Reserve.....	5-8

## **VOLUME II**

6-1	Disturbance Zones for Trail Alternative 4A.....	6-40
6-2	Disturbance Zones for Trail Alternative 4B.....	6-42
6-3	Disturbance Zones for Trail Alternative 4D .....	6-42